

# Implementation of measures for promotion of employment of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in 2018:

Evaluation report of Sector Strategy of the  
Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare 2018 -2022

**Artane Rizvanolli**

January 2019

\* This report has been drafted with the support of the project “Kosovo Integration Initiative KOSINT 2020” funded by the Foundation for Open Society, implemented by the Kosovo Education Center (KEC) in partnership with Balkan Sunflowers (BSFK), Syri i Vizionit (SIV) and Roma and Ashkalia Documentation Center (RADC). Content of this publication cannot in any way be taken as a reflection of the views of the Foundation for Open Society.

KEC expresses its gratitude to representatives of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare, Employment Agency of the Republic of Kosovo, Office of Good Governance (Office of the Prime Minister), and civil society organizations for their information and contribution to this report.



# Content

---

- 1. Introduction.....4
- 2. Context.....5
- 3. Measures, activities and achieved results.....8
  - 3.1 Measure 1: Research, definition of gender sensitive indicators and reporting on the labour market situation ..... 8
  - 3.2 Measure 2: Improvement of representation of Roma and Ashkali communities in employment in public institutions and public enterprises .....9
  - 3.3 Measure 3: Research and implementation of affirmative action measures for employment of Roma and Ashkali communities .....11
  - 3.4 Measure 4: Assessment of needs and effectiveness of employment services and AALM.....13
  - 3.5 Measure 5: Design/modification of employment and active labour measures in harmony with the needs of Roma and Ashkali communities .....14
  - 3.6 Measure 6: Organization of information campaigns on employment services and active labour market measures .....15
- 4. Conclusions and recommendations..... 17

# 1. Introduction

The purpose of this report is to assess the level of achievement of results and implementation of activities and measures envisaged in the Sector Strategy of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare 2018-2020 regarding the promotion of employment of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo during 2018.

For this purpose, strategic documents, analyses, annual reports and data of relevant institutions for the recent years have been studied, with a special focus on those of 2018. Also, through the semi-structured questionnaire, representatives of relevant institutions were interviewed:

Department of Labour and Employment, Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare  
Employment Agency of the Republic of Kosovo

Office of Good Governance, Office of Prime Minister in the Government of Kosovo

Having in mind that a part of the measures and activities in the MLSW Sector Strategy are envisaged to be implemented in cooperation with civil society organizations, or by the organizations themselves, and with the view of obtaining full information from the field, for the purpose of this report was also organised:

A group interview (also semi-structured) with representatives of projects or nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) dealing mainly or exclusively with issues of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo. Balkan Sunflowers, Nevo Concept, Syri i Vizionit, Terres des Hommes, The Ideas Partnership, Network of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian Women's Organizations.

Based on the sources above, the report summarizes the achievements of 2018 in the field of promoting employment of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in Kosovo with a special focus on the activities, measures and outcomes foreseen by the Sector Strategy of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare 2018-2022, which in this area refers to the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017 - 2021.

The report is organized as it follows. Section 2 presents the context of this analysis and summarizes the relevant strategic documents in this area. Section 3 presents the measures, activities and outcomes foreseen by the Sector Strategy of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare 2018-2022 (and Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017 - 2021) as well as the level of their fulfilment during 2018. Section 4 summarizes the findings and offers several recommendations for implementation of this area of the strategy over the coming years.

## 2. Context

Although official data on labour market indicators disaggregated at the community level are missing in Kosovo, different analyses show that the employment situation of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities is very serious, as it is also included in the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma Communities and Ashkali in Kosovo Society 2017-2021. These communities have the highest unemployment rate and lower employment rate compared to the Albanian majority, as well as other minority communities in Kosovo. For example, the 2010 Human Development Report estimates that the unemployment rate for these communities in 2009 was about 58 per cent, compared to the 45 per cent of population average.<sup>1</sup> Meanwhile, some years later it is estimated that the employment rate for Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians in the municipalities of Obiliq and Fushë Kosovë was only 7 per cent, compared to 40 per cent for Albanians and 21 per cent for Serbs.<sup>2</sup> Furthermore, the jobs in which these communities are engaged are often temporary, and they are physical jobs that do not require high skills and are not well paid,<sup>3</sup> while these communities are also underrepresented in employment in public institutions and public enterprises,<sup>4</sup> although there is a legal framework that guarantees their involvement in public sector employment.

Having this situation in mind, employment is one of the areas identified as areas of special importance for integration of these communities (together with education, housing, social welfare and health) in the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017 - 2021 approved by the Government of Kosovo in April 2017. It should be noted that this Strategy was initially dedicated to Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities, but the Kosovo Government has removed the Egyptian community from the measures envisaged in the Strategy at the final stage of the approval since the final version of this strategic document was drafted in a comprehensive process during which the Office for Good Governance (OGG) within the Office of Prime Minister in the Government of Kosovo, relevant ministries and numerous civil society organizations in Kosovo dealing with the issues of these communities co-operated.

Although the Strategy in the final version approved by the Kosovo Government refers only to Roma and Ashkali communities, it is encouraging that despite this fact the Kosovar institutions have continued to work

<sup>1</sup> United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), Human Development Report 2010.

<sup>2</sup> United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), Community Vulnerability Assessment Report, 2013.

<sup>3</sup> Kosovo Foundation for Open Society (KFOS), Situation of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian Communities in Kosovo, 2010, and the International Labour Organization (ILO), Youth Transition for Good Work: Evidence from Kosovo, ILO Employment Policy Document 2007/4.

<sup>4</sup> Sh.Berisha for Kosovo Democratic Institute (KDI), Parliamentary Research: Representation of non-majority communities in civil service, 2016, and Office of the Prime Minister/Office for Community Affairs, Evaluation of Employment of Members of Non-majority Communities in the Civil Service and Public Enterprises in Kosovo, 2013.

on integration of these three communities without distinction, bearing in mind that despite the potential differences between them, these three communities face the same challenges in the field of employment. Inclusion of this community in regular activities (such as forums, joint meetings, etc.) as well as in specific activities to enhance their integration during 2018 (to continue in 2019) is confirmed by the OGG. Similarly, the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare (MLSW) in its 2018-2022 Sector Strategy as well as Employment Policy for the Employment Agency of the Republic of Kosovo 2019-2021 refers to these three communities in the objectives and activities envisaged for promotion of employment in Kosovo.

In the field of employment, MLSW Sector Strategy 2018-2022 defines the Strategic Objective 1 and five specific Objectives further outlining this objective, one of which is improvement the employment levels of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities (see Box 2. 1).

**Strategic objective 1:** Reduce inactivity, increase of employment, and develop skills in line with labour market demands and better labour market management.

**Specific objective 1.1:** Building capacity of public employment services

**Specific objective 1.2:** Expansion and diversification of employment services and AALM, and increase of their efficiency and quality

**Objektiviti specifik 1.3:** Provision of quality vocational training services in line with the labour market needs

**Specific objective 1.4:** Increase of youth employment

**Specific Objective 1.5:** Improvement of the level of employment of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian community members (activities planned in the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017 - 2021)

\*Note that the MLSW Sector Strategy at the time of its drafting refers to the Strategy Paper on the Inclusion of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian Communities, before the Egyptian community is removed from the text at the final stage

Box 2.1: Objectives of the MLSW Sector Strategy 2018-2022  
Source: MLSW Sector Strategy 2018-2022

For the specific Objective 1.5 which refers to the employment level of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian community members, the MLSW Sector Strategy 2018-2022 does not envisage additional specific activities, but it refers to the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017 – 2021. Taking into account the realistic policymakers' ability to influence the level of employment of these communities in the conditions of a market economy, as well as the legal framework in force, the latter provides for measures and activities that can be summarized as it follows:

Encouraging implementation of the legal framework regulating representation in employment of members of non-majority communities in the civil service in favour of employment of these communities.

Encouraging employment of these communities in the public and private sector through active labour market measures implemented by the Employment Agency of the Republic of Kosovo (EARK)<sup>56</sup>, including measures that encourage employers to hire members of these communities (e.g. salary subsidies) and those that increase the skills of jobseekers of these communities to prepare them for jobs in line with the market needs (such as vocational training). Within these activities is also included the information on these communities on opportunities that EARK provides for the unemployed, as a precondition that would improve their access to available services and measures.

The following section provides a rather detailed overview of the measures and activities envisaged in these strategic documents, as well as their level of implementation and progress in achieving the envisaged results (where data allow) during 2018.

Having in mind that for the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017 - 2021, whose activities have been transferred to the Sector Strategy of MLSW 2018-2022, there is an Evaluation Framework supported by the EU-funded project "Kosovo Education and Employment Network – KEEN," this framework has also been taken into account while carrying out this evaluation. It should also be stressed that despite the fact that the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017-2021 refers only to Roma and Ashkali communities, during this evaluation the statistics and activities for all three communities (Roma, Ashkali and Egyptians) will be reported for two reasons: (i) to reflect more fully the activities of institutions, which, as explained above, continue to engage in improving the situation of these three communities, and (ii) for practical and technical reasons since at the time of drafting the Strategy, statistics for the base year (e.g. participation of these communities in active labour market measures) were calculated having the three communities in mind, so any methodological change at this stage would make the comparison between actual and base figures meaningless.

<sup>5</sup> Note that the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017 - 2021 refers to these as "measures implemented by the MLSW" since this was the practice until the establishment and functioning of the EARK, which is now responsible for implementation of active labour market measures, while MLSW has the policy-making role in the field of employment promotion.

<sup>6</sup> Kosovo Education and Employment Network (KEEN), Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo 2017 - 2021: Monitoring Framework, 2017

### 3. Measures, activities and achieved results

#### 3.1 Measure 1: Research, definition of gender sensitive indicators and reporting on the labour market situation

The first envisaged measure in the Strategy on the employment field is “research, definition of gender sensitive indicators and reporting on the labour market situation of members of Roma and Ashkali communities and their benefits from services/measures delivered by the MLSW ”.<sup>7</sup>

Within this measure it is envisaged to analyse possibilities for using the existing data, with particular focus on periodic data sources such as the Labour Force Survey (LFS) and the Labour Management Information System (LMIS) of EARK, which would enable the monitoring of labour market situation of these communities. Information that would need to include: the level/rate of employment of these communities in general and by sectors/characteristics of work (regular or temporary work, formal or informal work, economic activity, public/private sector); and other basic labour market indicators (unemployment rate, participation rate in the labour market). During the research, no statistics or reports that prove this activity were found. Also, based on interviews with the institutions and NGOs dealing with issues of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities, no concrete steps for carrying out this activity have been identified. It should be emphasised that during the research, several reports published in 2018 regarding the situation in labour market of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities have been identified: (i) The International Labour Organisation (ILO) has published a research on youth perspective and experiences of these communities in three municipalities (Gjakovë, Fushë Kosovë and Graçanicë), focusing on the challenges and opportunities to find a decent job<sup>8</sup>; and (ii) NGO Nevo Concept has published an analysis of the situation of workers of these communities in the municipality of Prizren<sup>9</sup>. However, despite all the relevant information they contain, these analyses do not consist progress in the context of this Strategy’s activity as they do not provide country-wide data and standard labour market statistics such as employment rates, unemployment rates, and so on.

Also, under Measure 1 it is envisaged that regular statistics collected through the LMIS of EARK, such as the number and percentage of registered jobseekers, jobseekers for whom employment was mediated, participants in vocational training and other active market measures work, to be reported separately for each of these communities. This activity has been implemented, as evidenced by the annual report “Work and Employment Report of the EARK for 2017”<sup>10</sup>, which for the first time reports all the statistics from the LMIS for each of the three communities separately<sup>11</sup>.

<sup>7</sup> Note that in the new institutional context, this measure should refer to the measures provided by the EARK.

<sup>8</sup> International Labour Organization (ILO), Promotion of decent work opportunities for Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian youth in Kosovo, 2018.

<sup>9</sup> Nevo Concept, Analysis of the current situation of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian community workers in the Municipality of Prizren, 2018.

<sup>10</sup> Employment Agency of the Republic of Kosovo (EARK), Work and Employment: Annual report 2017, 2018.

<sup>11</sup> Annual report for 2017 isn’t public, but it has been provided by EARK for the purposes of this research.



**Measure 1:** Research, definition of gender sensitive indicators and reporting on the labour market situation and their benefits from services/measures delivered by the MLSW.

**Activity 1.1:** Definition of tender sensitive indicators of employment and work characteristics for these two communities from the Labour Market Research data.  
Although there have been some other studies in this area by various organizations, during 2018 no progress was made in implementation of this activity, as it was foreseen.

**Activity 2.1:** Regular reporting of data regarding benefits of members of these communities from services and measures delivered by the MLSW  
This activity was implemented during 2018.

Box 3.1: Summary of findings for Measure 1

### 3.2 Measure 2: Improvement of representation of Roma and Ashkali communities in employment in public institutions and public enterprises

Since 2010, the Law 03/L-149 on Civil Service of the Republic of Kosovo defines representation in the civil service for non-majority communities through a minimum 10 per cent quota at the central level and proportional representation of the demographic composition at the municipal level. This measure envisages regular monitoring and reporting on implementation of the existing legal framework, with a particular focus on representation in line with the composition of the population at the municipal level; but also at the central level, although there are no specific quotas for communities separately. In case of flaws in implementation of the legal framework, the measure envisages that the causes must be investigated and required measures should be taken. Having the nature of these activities in mind, it was foreseen that these activities be implemented by NGOs, with the support of donors. No new analyses have been identified for this issue since the approval of the Strategy (the latest is the KDI analysis in 2016<sup>12</sup>) or activities (roundtables, etc.) aimed at raising awareness of institutions and the public and advocating for greater involvement of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in employment in the public sector. However, it should be stressed that the OGG in its annual report on implementation of the Strategy for the Roma and Ashkali Communities 2017-2021 for the 2017 has reported the employment status of these communities in ministries and other institutions at the central level<sup>13</sup>.

<sup>12</sup> Sh.Berisha for the Kosovo Democratic Institute (KDI), Parliamentary Research: Representation of non-majority communities in civil service, 2016

<sup>13</sup> Office of Good Governance (OGG), First Report on Implementation of the Strategy and Action Plan for Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society, 2017 – 2021 for the years 2017, 2018.

The measure also envisages specific targeting of these communities in being engaged as employment counsellors (followed by training of these counsellors), which would help strengthen the access of institutions to these communities and strengthen their trust in institutions. This has not been accomplished even during 2018 and the EARK has stated that targeting of members of these communities cannot be done because in public competitions as the recruitment procedures are regulated by law and do not allow such a criterion in the competition.

<b>Measure 1:</b> Improvement of representation of Roma and Ashkali communities in employment in public institutions and public enterprises.
<b>Activity 2.1:</b> Monitoring of employment situation in public institutions in municipalities with higher participation of these communities. This activity was not implemented during 2018.
<b>Activity 2.2:</b> Monitoring of employment situation in public institutions at the central level This activity, as envisioned in the Strategy, was not implemented during 2018, although in its annual report on the implementation of the Strategy for Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo 2017-2021, for 2017, the OGG reported on the employment status of these communities in ministries and other institutions at the central level.
<b>Activity 2.3:</b> Information and advocacy based on research results. This activity follows the previous 2.1 and 2.2 activities, therefore it is implied that it was not possible to be implemented.
<b>Activity 2.4:</b> Hiring of employment counsellors from these communities in municipalities with the highest number of jobseekers of these communities. This activity was not implemented during 2018 and doubts have been raised as to whether such form of recruitment on ethnic grounds is possible at all within the existing legal framework.
<b>Activity 2.5:</b> Training of the engaged employment counsellors This activity follows the previous 2.4 activity, therefore it is implied that it was not possible to be implemented.

Box 3.1: Summary of findings for Measure 2

### 3.3 Measure 3: Research and implementation of affirmative action measures for employment of Roma and Ashkali communities

Measure 3 provides for analysis of potential affirmative measures (including international practices in this area) that could be used for employment of Roma and Ashkali communities by businesses and non-profit organizations. The research would focus in particular on the feasibility of these and the fair implementation (e.g. the definition of the measure, criteria for benefiting, the criteria assessment procedures, including the verification of the employee's ethnicity). Although during 2018 there was a report that *inter alia* analysed international practices for promoting employment of Roma community in other European countries by the Kosova Education Center (KEC), which partially contributes to the implementation of this measure, this activity was not implemented as it was envisaged.

The measure also envisages that quotas as a measure of affirmative action continue to be used for schemes of active labour market measures and vocational training, and that these are to be specifically defined for these communities. During 2018 no quota was set for participation of these communities, but progress was made by addressing the issue of employment of their members in the main policy making document in the field of employment promotion from MLSW, Employment Policy for the Employment Agency of the Republic of Kosovo 2019-2021. Although it does not envisage quotas for specific schemes, this document reflects activities envisaged by the Strategy for promoting employment of these communities and sets targets for the EARK for inclusion of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in active market measures of the work, including the vocational training offered at the Vocational Training Centres, as follows:

Table 3.1: Targets for inclusion of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities

Indicator	Initial situation	2019	Targets	
	2017		2020	2021
% of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities benefiting from active labour market measures	3%	4%	5%	6%
% of persons from Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities who are mediated on employment	3.4%	4%	5%	6%

Source: MLSW, Employment Policy for the Employment Agency of the Republic of Kosovo 2019-2021

Although the Employment Policy envisages a doubling of participation of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian community members, it should be stressed that the base (initial situation) for 2017 used in this document is much lower than that of the previous year (6 per cent) is used in the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017 - 2021, to which the Sector Strategy of the Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare 2018-2022 refers. Consequently, the target for 2021 of 6 per cent is much lower than that of 10 per cent set with Strategy for the same year. It should also be stressed that during 2018 this participation was only 2.6 per cent.

**Measure 3:** Research and implementation of affirmative action measures for employment of Roma and Ashkali communities

**Activity 3.1:** Research of affirmative action measures that have worked in other countries

Although during 2018 there was a report which among others analysed the international practices for promoting employment of Roma community in other European countries by Kosova Education Center (KEC), which contributes in part to implementation of this measure, this activity has not been implemented as envisaged.

**Activity 3.2:** Application of quotas to active labour market measures (including vocational training)

Although quotas were not implemented during 2018, the main policymaking document in the field of employment promotion from MLSW, Employment Policy for the Employment Agency of the Republic of Kosovo 2019-2021, has set annual targets for inclusion of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities. However, these targets are not in line with the Strategy, aiming at a 6 per cent involvement in 2021, while the Strategy envisages inclusion of 10 per cent. During 2018 the participation was only 2.6 per cent.

Box 3.2: Summary of findings for Measure3

### 3.4 Measure 4: Assessment of needs and effectiveness of employment services and AALM

---

Measure 4 envisages assessment of specific needs and challenges of Roma and Ashkali communities, and assessment of the effectiveness of employment services and AALM (including vocational training) implemented in the past; these would constitute the basis for designing or modifying services and AALM in accordance with the specific needs of these communities. The analysis would include perceptions of these communities and their assessment of the accessibility and effectiveness of these services/measures, as well as objective measures of their effectiveness such as the employment status of beneficiaries and the employment sustainability. During 2018, several reports have been identified that partially address this activity, namely the issue of identifying the specific needs and challenges of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in terms of employment (two reports published by KEC and one from the ILO) as well as their perceptions regarding the access to employment promotion/employment measures and their effectiveness. However, the existing reports add little value in terms of measuring the effectiveness of services and measures through a rigorous methodology and objective measures such as the employment status of beneficiaries after receiving service/measure, employment sustainability, income effect, quality of workplace, etc. EARK for the first time has taken steps to study the effect of active measures (including vocational training) that it provides for all beneficiaries, and will try to do it at the level of different communities if the data allow this.

**Measure 4:** Assessment of the needs and effectiveness of employment services and active labour market measures

**Activity 4.1:** Drafting of analysis of the needs and effectiveness of services/active labour market measures for these two communities

Several researches (from KEC and ILO) of 2018 have contributed to the partial implementation of this activity by analysing the needs, challenges and perceptions of members of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities, but a rigorous study of the effectiveness of measures and services was not carried out.

**Box 3.4:** Summary of findings for Measure 4

### 3.5 Measure 5: Design/modification of employment and active labour measures in harmony with the needs of Roma and Ashkali communities

Measure 5 envisages that based on the findings of the needs assessment and effectiveness of services as well as active labour market measures implemented earlier, to design/modify services and active measures or, if necessary, provide additional services (e.g. language courses or coverage of transport costs) in order to ensure inclusion of Roma and Ashkali communities. This would be done with the active participation of NGOs of Roma and Ashkali communities and the measures would be diverse, including, inter alia, training and (subsidized) practical work in the private sector; subsidizing the salary for a certain period of time; measures for self-employment development, including start-up grants.

Although new services or measures have not been specifically designed for members of these communities, EARK has continued to provide active labour market measures for these communities. During 2018, 48 members of the Roma, 115 Ashkali and 60 Egyptian communities benefited from the active labour market measures provided by EARK, which in total did not reach the number of 300 beneficiaries per year foreseen in the Strategy (see Table 3.2). However, the number of grant beneficiaries for business start-ups from these communities was four times higher than anticipated (40 compared to 10); this at least partially reflects the focus of institutions and donors in supporting the repatriated people from European countries through self-employment grants, a significant part of which belong to these three communities.

Table 3.2: Beneficiaries of active labour market measures from EARK

Active labour market measures	Rom	Ashkali	Egjiptian	Total
Vocational education in VEC	26	60	38	124
Self-employment	7	19	14	40
On job training	9	14	2	25
Professional practice	3	10	2	15
Salary subsidy	2	8	4	14
Public work	1	4	0	5
<b>Total</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>115</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>223</b>

As far as the benefit of these communities from the mediation service to regular employment is concerned, during 2018 we have an increase compared to the previous year for 11%; in 2018, 112 members of these communities (38 Roma, 40 Ashkali, 44 Egyptians) were mediated in employment, compared to 110 in the previous year. During 2018, there has also been a significant increase in the participation of these communities in the total number of mediations in regular employment, reaching 3.8 per cent, compared to 2.9 per cent in 2017.

**Box 3.5:** Summary of findings for Measure 5

**Measure 5:** Design/modification of (additional) employment services and active labour market measures, including vocational training, in harmony with the needs of Roma and Ashkali communities

**Activity 5.1:** During 2018, active labour market measures/employment services have not been designed (or modified) specifically to meet the needs of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities.

**Activity 5.2:** Provision of:

a) Active labour market measures (300 beneficiaries a year); Grants for business start ups (10 a year) Although there are no specific services or measures for members of these communities, EARK has continued to provide active labour market measures for these communities. During 2018, 223 members of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities benefited from active work measures.

b) Grants for business start ups (10 a year)

During 2018, 40 grants for business start ups were awarded to members of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities.

**3.6 Measure 6: Organization of information campaigns on employment services and active labour market measures**

Measure 6 envisages organization of information campaigns designed in such a way as to ensure access to Roma and Ashkali communities, taking into account the media and the means of communication used by these communities; the campaigns would also include visits of employment counsellors to the field. Campaigns would utilize the existing capacities and access to communities of learning centres and NGOs of these communities. During the research, cases of such activities were identified on the initiative of civil society organizations in several municipalities (e.g. in Rahovec, Prizren and Mitrovicë). However, at EARK level, which is a new organization faced with institutional transition challenges, there were no information campaigns. At this stage EARK engaged to collect information on the level of information and perceptions of all citizens on EARK services (through surveys), after which the comprehensive information campaigns are planned to take place, respectively targeting all the unemployed and jobseekers, including minority com-

munities. If the number of registered unemployed is taken as an indication of the level of information for services and active labour market measures offered by the EARK, we do not see any (visible) distinction during 2018. During this year, the number of registered unemployed persons from these three communities was 5225 (1751 Roma, 2637 Ashkali, 837 Egyptians), which in total accounted for 5.5% of the registered unemployed persons. During 2017, this figure was 5155 (1784 Roma, 2641 Ashkali, 720 Egyptians), while the total number of registered unemployed persons was the same.

**Measure 6:** Organization of information campaigns on employment services and active labour market measures, including the vocational training

**Activity 6.1:** Organization of an information campaign with members of Roma and Ashkali communities

During 2018 there have been cases of such activities at the initiative of civil society organizations in several municipalities (e.g. in Rahovec, Prizren and Mitrovicë), but the systematic promotion campaigns or activities by EARK still haven't happened, targeted nor in general.

Box 3.6: Summary of findings for Measure 6

### 3.7 Measure 7: Promotion of success stories in the labour market of Roma and Ashkali community members

Measure 7 envisages promotion of cases of members of Roma and Ashkali communities who have achieved success in employment or self-employment/business, with particular focus on women. No such EARK activities have been identified during the research.

**Measure 7:** Promotion of cases of success stories in the labour market of Roma and Ashkali community members

**Activity 7.1:** Broadcast of promotional videos. This activity hasn't been implemented during 2018.

Box 3.7: Summary of findings for Measure 7



## 4. Conclusions and recommendations

This report assessed the level of implementation of measures, activities and results (where the data allowed) dedicated to improving the employment of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities based on the Sector Strategy of MLSW 2018-2022, which on this issue refers to the Strategy for the Inclusion of Roma and Ashkali Communities in Kosovo Society 2017 - 2021.

The research was based on the study and reviews of strategic documents, analyses, data and other relevant documents published over the course of 2018, as well as semi-structured interviews (individual and in group) with relevant institutions and civil society organizations dealing with issues of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities.

During 2018 progress has been marked in some of the activities of this Strategy, although some have been implemented only partially:

For the first time in the EARK Annual Report, Work and Employment for 2017, reporting of statistics from SMIA was done separately for each of these three communities, which enables monitoring of the status per indicator, such as the number and percentage of registered jobseekers, jobseekers for whom employment was mediated, participants in vocational training and other active labour market measures, etc.

There were several researches of various organizations (e.g. KEC, ILO, Nevo Concept) that have looked into the challenges, needs and perspectives of employment for Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian community members, which may help to design services and employment promotion measures that are in line with the specific needs of these communities. However, no research has been carried out on the effectiveness of services and active labour market measures implemented for these communities in the past, which would be equally important to inform their design/modification in the future. It is recommended that now that the EARK has experience with some similar research, these analyses are also done specifically for members of these communities.

Although no quotas have been implemented for participation of these communities in active labour market measures during 2018, the issue of employment of these communities has been widely addressed in the main policymaking document in the field of employment promotion from MLSW, Employment Policy for the Agency Employment of the Republic of Kosovo 2019-2021. This document has set annual targets for inclusion of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities into active labour market measures provided by EARK in the coming years. However, it should be stressed that these targets are lower than those envisaged in the Strategy, aiming at a 6 per cent inclusion in 2021, while the Strategy envisages inclusion of 10 per cent. Also, during 2018 the participation was only 2.6 per cent. As these targets are the minimum to be

achieved, it is recommended that efforts must be made to overcome these targets.

At the initiative of civil society organizations, during 2018 several activities were organized with the aim of informing members of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in several municipalities, as there were no information campaigns organized by EARK, which is a new organization that is now at stage of researching the public, after which it is planned to have comprehensive campaigns (for all potential jobseekers). It is recommended that the EARK campaigns in the coming years to also include activities, information channels and adequate promotion materials to outreach these communities.

Although no services or measures tailored to meet the needs of these communities have been specifically designed, these communities participated in the active labour market measures provided by the EARK. During 2018, there were 223 participants from Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities, compared to 300 participants that were planned. However, the planned norm of 10 beneficiaries of business start-up grants has been multiply overcome, thus reaching 40 beneficiaries.

On the other hand, progress was not achieved in some other activities:

No efforts have been made to calculate standard labour market statistics based on the LFS, or other data sources.

Civil society has not monitored and reported the situation of representation of these communities in employment in the public sector and the level of compliance with the legal framework in force in this field, which would increase information, advocacy and public pressure to improve the situation.

Employment counsellors of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities have not been engaged. This issue should be tackled once again from the legal point of view to see if and how this could be done within the legal framework in force.

No active labour market measures that reflect the specific challenges of these communities have been designed.

No cases of success in the labour market of members of these communities have been promoted. It is recommended that this is done within the framework of the EARK's comprehensive information campaign in the years to come.



# **Implementation of measures for promotion of employment of Roma, Ashkali and Egyptian communities in 2018:**

Evaluation report of Sector Strategy of the  
Ministry of Labour and Social Welfare 2018 -2022



**OPEN SOCIETY  
FOUNDATIONS**

**Roma Initiatives Office**